Hype or real threat: The extent of predatory journals in student bibliographies

By Rainer Schira, Acting University Librarian, & Chris Hurst, Systems Librarian

Why this research is important

Since 2012, thousands of potentially predatory journals have erupted all over the internet. While there is no agreed upon definition of what a predatory journal is, they commonly pretend to offer peer-review, pretend to have reputable journal editors, aggressively solicit articles through email-spamming, and lie about their inclusion in commonly used research indexes like Web of Science or PubMed. The main purpose of predatory journals is to make money by charging article submission fees. Article submission fees are a common practice for reputable open access journals, but predatory journals do not provide any of the benefits that reputable journals do. Unsuspecting authors can find themselves in a position where their articles have not actually been improved through peer-review and where their research has very little impact—as predatory journals are often not found in reputable indexes. On the flip side, authors can choose to publish a substandard article specifically in a predatory journal to get a quick citation necessary for promotion. If a researcher's CV is not properly checked during a promotion procedure, the author can be promoted despite doing poor research. As well, these substandard articles can be found with a Google search, and unsuspecting students may accept their worth uncritically.

Much has been written about what makes a journal predatory, the importance of understanding how to spot and avoid predatory journals (including lists of journals and publishers to avoid), who publishes in predatory journals and why, and how many predatory journals are found in commonly used library research databases. No one yet has asked if students use them in their bibliographies for their university research assignments.

What you need to know

For this project, we studied if students use potentially predatory journals in their research assignments. We also wanted to know if students are aware what predatory journals are and how students conduct their research.
How the research was conducted

Our initial research was done in the winter of 2017 with a follow-up study in the fall of 2019. In both cases, we received permission by Brandon University professors, whose assignments included a research paper, to ask their students to provide us with their assignment bibliographies.

The initial 2017 study also included a questionnaire of faculty members to find out what they knew and thought about peer-review, open access journals, and predatory journals. The follow-up 2019 study also included focus groups to gain a better understanding of what students have to say about their research process, peer-review, and predatory journals.

What the researchers found

In 2017, we collected a total of 245 bibliographies, including 2,359 citations. Of the 1,485 citations to journals in these citations, five were found to cite journals from potentially predatory journals and publishers. We have gathered 249 bibliographies for our 2019 study but have not evaluated them at this point. We also conducted focus groups with 12 students. Again, their thoughts and insights have not yet been analyzed.

How this research can be used

Determining if students know about and use predatory journals in their assignments can help a university decide whether it should spend more effort educating students about this issue.

About the researchers

H. Rainer Schira is currently the Acting University Librarian. He has been at Brandon University since 2001 and has spent most of his time helping students and faculty learn how to do library research more effectively.

Chris Hurst is the Systems Librarian. He has been at Brandon University since 1998 and has taken on a wide variety of tasks as well as keeping the library systems running. He is currently the chair of the Brandon University Research Ethics Committee.

Publication based on this research


Acknowledgements

The research has been approved by the Brandon University Research Ethics Committee.

Research Connection is a periodical publication intended to provide information about the impact of Brandon University’s academic research and expertise on public policy, social programming, and professional practice. This summary is supported by the Office of Research Services and by the Centre for Aboriginal and Rural Education Studies, Faculty of Education.

Editor: Christiane Ramsey

http://www.brandonu.ca/research-connection